



Removal of 190 Speeches and Testimonies from ICE Website

Access Assessment Report
June 11, 2019

This report is accompanied by [a blog post](#), providing context for the changes detailed here.

Sunlight Foundation's Web Integrity Project webintegrity@sunlightfoundation.com

Report writer: [Sarah John](#)

Comprehensive reviewer: [Aaron Lemelin](#)

Content reviewer: [Jon Campbell](#)

[See WIP's Report Production Protocol for details of our review process](#)

Classification of Web content alterations and changes in access to Web resources:

Classification	Changes documented in this report?
1. Altering or removing text and non-text content	
2. Altering or removing links	
3. Moving an entire webpage or collection of webpages or establishing redirects	
4. Altering or removing an entire pertinent section of a webpage or collection of webpages	Yes
5. Removing an entire webpage or document	Yes
6. Overhauling or removing an entire website	
7. Altering or removing search engines and open data platforms	
8. Altering, removing, or deleting datasets	

The Sunlight Foundation's Web Integrity Project does not intend to assess any government agency's intentions in presenting the changes to webpages or other Web content that appear in this report.

Removal of 190 Speeches and Testimonies from ICE Website

Overview

On January 18 or 19, 2017, a collection of 190 transcripts of speeches, op-eds, and congressional testimonies written and delivered by Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) leadership was removed from the ICE website. All 190 items were removed from the [ICE.gov](https://www.ice.gov) domain, with the URLs currently returning a “file not found” notice or redirecting to a search.usa.gov search page containing no results. Items in the collection date as far back as 2004, just one year after the creation of ICE, through 2016. The collection included speeches and testimonies from both the George W. Bush and Barack Obama administrations.

Background

Agency details: According to its [website](https://www.ice.gov), “U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) enforces federal laws governing border control, customs, trade and immigration to promote homeland security and public safety.” Created in 2003, ICE “has an annual budget of approximately \$6 billion, primarily devoted to three operational directorates – Homeland Security Investigations (HSI), Enforcement and Removal Operations (ERO) and Office of the Principal Legal Advisor (OPLA).”

Communications about changes: ICE has not proactively communicated about or explained the changes described within this report.

Known archives: ICE maintains a small public Web archive of materials at <https://www.ice.gov/archive>. The ICE website links to this archive in the footer of webpages throughout the domain. The archive is incomplete, containing 15 items in total, from dates ranging January 2, 2011, to June 2, 2017. The archive does not contain any of the items detailed within this report.

Description of Most Notable Changes

1. Descriptions of and links to a collection of 190 transcripts of speeches and testimonies were removed from the “Speeches and Testimonies” page ([Webpage 1](#)) on the ICE website.
 - a. A table containing the date and description of each speech or testimony and linking to each document was removed between 3:25 PM ET on [January 18, 2017](#), and 11:03 PM ET on [January 19, 2017](#).
 - b. The table was replaced with the text: “There are no current speeches or testimonies.”
2. One hundred and ninety documents were removed from the [ICE.gov](https://www.ice.gov) domain ([Documents 1 - 8](#)).
 - a. The 190 items were PDF and .doc files containing transcripts of speeches and testimonies.
 - i. These documents were previously linked to from [Webpage 1](#) until January 18 or 19, 2017.

- ii. Most of the removed items contained prepared remarks delivered by ICE leadership at congressional hearings. Some of the removed items were speeches delivered at conferences and press conferences, as well as an op-ed published in the *Kansas City Star*. (For full details, see [Appendix Table 1.](#))
- b. The URL for each of the 190 items either returns a “file not found” notice or redirects to a search page with no results.
- c. Some of the content is available from alternative sources, including the U.S. Government Publishing Office, though finding the content requires significant searching and prior knowledge of the content ([Additional Information](#)).
 - i. Content from only one of the removed items is available elsewhere on the ICE website.
- d. [Appendix Table 1](#) is a spreadsheet detailing each of the 190 removed transcripts and contains descriptions of each of the removed items, IAMW links to archived versions of the items, and links to alternative sources of the content.

Table of Contents

Report Section	Title	URL/Description	Page Status
Webpage 1	Speeches and Testimonies	https://www.ice.gov/speeches	Altered
Documents 1 - 8	Examples of 190 Removed Speeches and Testimonies	Eight examples of removed items	Removed
Additional Information	This section details the availability of the removed items in other archives.		
Appendix Table 1	A spreadsheet detailing each of the 190 removed transcripts. The spreadsheet itemizes each removed item, including a description, link to an archived version of the article, current (March 2019) URL, and availability at alternative archives.		

Detailed Description of Changes in Access

Note: Throughout the entire report, links to the Internet Archive's Wayback Machine's (IAWM) versions of corresponding pages are provided for reference. IAWM displays time in GMT.

Webpage 1: Speeches and Testimonies

- URL: <https://www.ice.gov/speeches>
- Changes occurred between [January 18, 2017](#) and [January 19, 2017](#)
- There is no archived version of this page in ICE's [Web Archive](#).

Detail of Changes

1. The following content was changed on the "Speeches and Testimonies" page between [January 18, 2017](#), and [January 19, 2017](#) ([Screenshot 1.1](#) and [Screenshot 1.2](#)):
 - a. **Removed** a table listing and linking to a collection of 190 speeches and testimonies. This table contained details for each speech or testimony, including the speaker, the date, information on the subject matter, audience, and location, as well as a link to a PDF or .doc file containing a transcript of each speech or testimony.
 - i. All 190 speeches and testimonies have been removed and their URLs either return a "file not found" notice or redirect to a search page with no results (see [Documents 1 - 8](#)).
 - b. **Added** text that read "There are no current speeches or testimonies."

Subsequent changes: Since January 19, 2017, the "Speeches and Testimonies" page has been altered numerous times, including:

1. Between [January 19, 2017](#), and [January 24, 2017](#), the page was removed from public access.
2. Between [January 24, 2017](#), and [March 17, 2017](#), access to the page was restored, and text and a link to the congressional testimony of Matthew C. Allen, Assistant Director of ICE's Homeland Security Investigative Programs from February 16, 2017, was added to the page.
 - a. Since this time period, between January 2017 to March 2019, new speeches and testimonies have been added to the page. All pre-2017 versions removed from the page.

Screenshot 1.1: Internet Archive Wayback Machine snapshot of Webpage 1, "Speeches and Testimonies," on [January 18, 2017 at 15:25 ET](https://www.ice.gov/speeches) showing part of the removed table.

INTERNET ARCHIVE
Wayback Machine

441 captures
23 Oct 2014 - 26 Mar 2019

https://www.ice.gov/speeches

Go DEC JAN MAR
18
2015 2017 2018

Official Website of the Department of Homeland Security

**U.S. Immigration
and Customs
Enforcement**

Report Crimes: Email or Call 1-866-DHS-2-ICE

Home
Who We Are
About
What We Do
Newsroom
Information Library
Contact ICE

Speeches and Testimonies

SHARE

The driving forces within ICE speak about issues that affect the agency and the country, underscoring ICE's commitment to homeland security.

Speeches and Testimonies	
Date	Speaker
09/22/2016	Sarah R. Saldaña, Director, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement, Department of Homeland Security speaking before the before the U.S. House of Representatives Committee on the Judiciary regarding a hearing on 'Oversight of U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement' (PDF)
09/14/2016	Daniel H. Ragsdale, Deputy Director, Homeland Security Investigations, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement speaking before the before the U.S. House of Representatives Committee on Homeland Security regarding a hearing on 'Shutting Down Terrorist Pathways into America' (PDF)
07/14/2016	Daniel H. Ragsdale, Deputy Director, Homeland Security Investigations, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement Statement before the U.S. House of Representatives Oversight and Government Reform Committee regarding a hearing on 'Recalcitrant Countries' (PDF)
06/15/2016	Bruce Foucart, Assistant Director, National Intellectual Property Rights Coordination Center, Homeland Security Investigations, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement speaking before the U.S. Senate Committee on Finance regarding a hearing on "Challenges and Opportunities for U.S. Businesses in the Digital Age" (PDF)
05/19/2016	Thomas Homan, Executive Associate Director, Enforcement and Removal Operations, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement, Department of Homeland Security speaking before the U.S. Senate Committee on the Judiciary Subcommittee on Immigration and the National Interest regarding a hearing on Removal of Aliens from the United States in Recent years (PDF)
04/28/2016	Sarah R. Saldaña, Director, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement Department of Homeland Security speaking before the U.S. House of Representatives Committee on Oversight and Government Reform regarding a Hearing on Criminal Releases (PDF)
04/27/2016	Bruce Foucart, Director, National Intellectual Property Rights Coordination Center, Homeland Security Investigations, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement speaking before the U.S. Senate Committee on the Judiciary regarding a Hearing on Counterfeits and Their Impact on Consumer Health and Safety (PDF)
03/22/2016	Lev J. Kubiak, Assistant Director, International Operations Homeland Security Investigations U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement Department of Homeland Security, speaking before the U.S. House of Representatives Committee on Foreign Affairs Subcommittee on the Western Hemisphere regarding a Hearing on "Potential Terrorists Threats: Border Security Challenges in Latin America and the Caribbean" (PDF)
03/16/2016	Sarah R. Saldaña, Director, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement Department of Homeland Security, written testimony presented before the United States Senate Committee on Homeland Security and Governmental Affairs regarding a Hearing on the Security of U.S Visa Programs (PDF)
02/23/2016	Thomas Homan, Executive Associate Director, Enforcement and Removal Operations U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement Department of Homeland Security Statement

Related Information

Sign up to receive speeches email updates

Viewing Notice: Portable Document Format (".PDF") files may be viewed with the free [Adobe Acrobat Reader](#).

Screenshot 1.2: Internet Archive Wayback Machine snapshot of Webpage 1, “Speeches and Testimonies,” on [January 19, 2017 at 23:03 ET](#), showing the added text “There are no current speeches or testimonies.” (Note: The Internet Archive Wayback Machine displays in Coordinated Universal Time.)

The screenshot shows a Wayback Machine interface at the top with the URL <https://www.ice.gov/speeches> and a calendar highlighting January 20, 2017. Below the Wayback Machine is the official website header for the U.S. Department of Homeland Security, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. The navigation menu includes Home, Who We Are, About, What We Do, Newsroom, Information Library, and Contact ICE. The main content area is titled "Speeches and Testimonies" and contains a paragraph: "The driving forces within ICE speak about issues that affect the agency and the country, underscoring ICE's commitment to homeland security." Below this is the text: "There are no current speeches or testimonies." To the left of the main content is a "SHARE" section with icons for email, Facebook, Twitter, and Google+. To the right is a "Related Information" section with a "Sign up to receive speeches email updates" button and a "Viewing Notice: Portable Document Format (\".PDF\") files may be viewed with the free [Adobe Acrobat Reader](#)." At the bottom of the page are social media icons and a footer with links: En Español | DHS.gov | USA.gov | OIG | Open Gov | FOIA | Metrics | No Fear Act | Site Map | Site Policies & Plug-Ins.

Documents 1 - 8: Examples of 190 Removed Speeches and Testimonies

A collection of 190 PDF and .doc files were removed from [ICE.gov](#) in early 2017. [Webpage 1](#) formerly linked to all 190 of these files. Full details of each removed document are available in [Appendix Table 1](#).

Detail of Changes

1. Beginning on or before December 15, 2016, ICE removed a collection of 190 documents from its website.
 - a. The 190 items were PDF and .doc files containing speeches and testimonies that [Webpage 1](#) had linked to until January 18, 2019.
 - i. Most of the removed items contained prepared remarks delivered by ICE leadership at congressional hearings. Some of the removed items were speeches delivered at conferences and press conferences, as well as an op-ed published in the *Kansas City Star*.
 - b. The URLs for the items currently return a “file not found” notice or redirect to a [search.usa.gov](#) search page containing no results.
 - c. Due to sporadic snapshots in the Internet Archive Wayback Machine, we cannot provide a narrow date range for the removal of the documents. However, the first snapshot of a removed document from the collection is from [December 15, 2016](#) and the latest snapshot of a live document is from [January 18, 2017](#). See [Appendix Table 1](#) for full details.
 - d. The removed items range in date from February 25, 2004 to September 22, 2016, covering both the George W. Bush and the Barack Obama administrations.
 - e. The content of many of the items are available from alternative sources, including the U.S. Government Publishing Office, though finding the content requires significant searching and prior knowledge of the content ([Additional Information](#)).
 - i. Content from only one of those files is available on the ICE.gov domain at the time of writing (see Example 2, below).
2. In Table 1, we provide eight examples of removed items, all of which were formerly linked on [Webpage 1](#).
 - a. Each example identifies the date of the speech or testimony, a description, the speaker, the file URL, the file’s availability from the ICE.gov archive and other related archives, the last capture of the document in the Internet Archive Wayback Machine, and the date range of the file’s removal.

Note: *The search for content was not exhaustive and some content that we were unable to locate may be available somewhere on the Web. We searched the following sources in this*

order: the ICE.gov website, the DHS Testimonies Archives, the DHS News Archives; the Government Publishing Office archives (govinfo), the Homeland Security Digital Library, and then a general Google search. For details about these archives please refer to [Additional Information](#).

Table 1: Examples of Removed Speeches and Testimony Linked from Webpage 1

#	Date	Description of Removed Document	Speaker	URL	Where else is content available?	Last IAWM Version	Date range of removal ¹
1	9/22/16	Testimony before the U.S. House of Representatives Committee on the Judiciary regarding a hearing on "Oversight of U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement"	Sarah R. Saldaña, Director	https://www.ice.gov/sites/default/files/documents/Speech/2016/160922saldana.pdf	DHS Testimonies Archive	1/7/17	After 1/7/17
2	2/22/11	Speech at the Funeral of ICE Special Agent Jaime J. Zapata regarding Zapata's Contributions to ICE	John Morton, Director	https://www.ice.gov/doclib/news/library/speeches/022211morton.pdf	ICE website ²	12/28/16	12/28/16-3/8/17
3	11/29/10	Prepared remarks on "Operation in our Sites v2.0", at a news conference regarding Intellectual Property Rights	John Morton, Director	https://www.ice.gov/doclib/news/library/speeches/112910morton.pdf	Document not located	12/28/16	After 12/28/16
4	8/17/10	Remarks at the 2010 Border Enforcement Security Task Force Training Conference, San Diego	John Morton, Director	https://www.ice.gov/doclib/news/library/speeches/081710morton.pdf	Document not located	12/21/16	12/21/16 - 2/1/17
5	10/3/07	Press Conference in Los Angeles, California regarding Results of a Fugitive Operations Surge	Julie L. Myers, Assistant Secretary	https://www.ice.gov/doclib/news/library/speeches/070927lafugitiveoperationspressconf.pdf	Document not located	12/16/16	12/16/16 - 2/1/17
6	6/26/07	Op-Ed Article in the Kansas City Star, "No More Slaps on Wrist for Work-Site Violations"	Julie L. Myers, Assistant Secretary	https://www.ice.gov/doclib/news/library/speeches/070626KCityStarOpEd.pdf	Kansas City Star ³	12/21/16	12/21/16 - 2/10/17
7	4/6/06	Testimony before the House Committee on Appropriations - Subcommittee on Homeland Security regarding President's Fiscal Year (FY) 2007 Budget Request	Julie L. Myers, Assistant Secretary	https://www.ice.gov/doclib/news/library/speeches/060406ICEtestimonyFinal.pdf	Document not located	12/28/16	12/28/16 - 2/10/17
8	2/4/05	Speech regarding Progress in War on Terror at Duke Law Symposium	Michael J. Garcia, Assistant Secretary	https://www.ice.gov/doclib/news/library/speeches/garcia020405.pdf	Document not located	12/21/16	12/21/16 - 1/27/17

¹ The Internet Archive Wayback Machine has not captured all URLs in Table 1 after they were removed. Where no contemporaneous Internet Archive Wayback Machine snapshot was captured, no date range is provided.

² A webpage containing the [transcript of Morton's remarks](#) is available in the "News Releases" section of the ICE website and [video of Morton delivering his remarks](#) is embedded on that page.

³ The op-ed is available at a fee (\$9.95 and up) from the [Kansas City Star archives](#).

Additional Information: Availability of the 190 Removed Items from Other Sources

Although ICE maintains a small public Web archive of materials (<https://www.ice.gov/archive>), none of the 190 removed items are preserved there. As noted, content from only one of the 190 removed items is available elsewhere on the ICE website (in the “News Releases” section of the website).

The content from many of the speeches and testimonies removed from <https://www.ice.gov/speeches> ([Webpage 1](#)) is available elsewhere on federal websites and in public web archives, though finding the content requires significant searching and prior knowledge of the content.

1. **DHS Archive:** ICE’s parent agency, the Department of Homeland Security (DHS), hosts an archive of testimonies at <https://www.dhs.gov/news-releases/testimony> and an archive of news articles at <https://www.dhs.gov/news>. Collectively, these searchable archives host more than 80 of the removed documents, dating back to 2009 ([Appendix Table 1](#)).
2. **GPO Archive:** The Government Publishing Office (GPO) preserves U.S. Senate and U.S. House testimonies in its archive of congressional hearings, dating back to 1995. Its collection is incomplete (the GPO publishes committee hearing proceedings only at the request of the committee). Many removed documents dating back to 2004 are available by searching the GPO’s archive at <https://www.govinfo.gov/>.
3. **HSDL Archive:** According to [its website](#), the Homeland Security Digital Library (HSDL), a collection sponsored by DHS and the Naval Postgraduate School Center for Homeland Defense and Security, is “the nation’s premier collection of documents related to homeland security policy, strategy, and organizational management.” The HSDL archive (<https://www.hsdl.org/?search>) contains testimonies as well as some of the speeches and press conference statements that were held in the [ICE.gov/speeches](#) archive.

Table 2 summarizes the results of WIP’s search for transcripts of each item in the ICE speech and testimony collection, showing availability at other sources by type of transcript (e.g. testimony to committees, speeches, press conference remarks). As noted earlier, WIP’s search for content was not exhaustive and some content that we were unable to locate may be available somewhere on the Web.

Table 2: Availability of 190 Speeches and Testimonies Removed from ICE.gov in federal web archives

	All	Testimonies/ Statements to Congressional Committees	Speeches at conferences or meetings	Press conference remarks	Other speeches	Newspaper Op-eds
Number of documents	190	161	21	6	1	1
Date of earliest document	2/25/2004	2/25/2004	4/5/2004	12/13/2006	2/22/2011	6/26/2007
Date of most recent document	9/22/2016	9/22/2016	10/28/2011	11/29/2010	2/22/2011	6/26/2007
Number (%) available on ICE.gov	1 (1%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	1 (100%)	0 (0%)
Number (%) available at DHS archives	86 (45%)	86 (53%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
Number (%) located elsewhere	71 (38%)	67 (42%)	2 (10%)	2 (33%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
Number (%) not located	32 (17%)	8 (5%)	19 (90%)	4 (67%)	0 (0%)	1 (100%)

Appendix Table 1

[Appendix Table 1](#) is a spreadsheet detailing each of the 190 removed transcripts. It provides information on each transcript's status, content, and format, as well as links to the transcript's URL, Internet Archive Wayback Machine snapshots of the removed transcripts and, where relevant, alternative sources of the transcripts. [Appendix Table 1](#) is available [here](#).